

DULWICH SYMPHONY ORCHESTRA

CONSTITUTION WORKING GROUP

CWG 4 (minutes) annex

This table records the discussion and substantive comments in respect of each of the amendments considered by the working group.

amendment	action ¹	comments
A	Withdrawn	The WG agreed that, given the lack of understanding why this provision was in the model constitutions, having been unable to get a view of what the effect of removing it would be, and given that amendment to article 1 would trigger the requirement to seek Charity Commission approval, this should be withdrawn.
B	Accept as amended thus: 'The Committee may propose to a General meeting of the Society the award of honorary membership in individual cases'.	It was agreed that this should be for the membership to decide rather than the Committee, and that the basis for honorary membership should be left undefined. It was decided not to be necessary to define the benefits of such membership, although an honorary member was thought to be distinct from a playing member.
C	Amendment withdrawn	The first part happens anyway as part of the administration of the Orchestra, and the second part was thought to be unlawful and in any case undesirable. It was however noted that the Secretary already had a duty to act promptly to pass on communications from individual members to the membership if they were relevant to the business of the Society, particularly if they related to constitutional matters.
D	Accepted in this form: The Committee will act fairly and promptly in response to a complaint made by a member of the Society about the management of	In discussion, it was noted that it was quite proper that the Society should have a formal complaints procedure. There was a strong opinion that the Society should avoid developing a culture of litigiousness which would be disproportionate to its size, purpose and voluntary nature.

¹ 'accept' means that the amendment will be recommended in the draft report prepared by the convenor, subject to modification, redrafting etc as shown in the table.

	business or about the conduct of another member. The Committee will give the complainant and any other person referred to in the complaint an account of the process by which it reached any decision.	
E	Withdrawn	
F	Withdrawn	The names of the committee members are published on the Society's web site. It was agreed that it was reprehensible that the website had been out of date in this respect for a period during 2010. It was agreed that the web master should be reminded of the need to keep the site up to date.
G	Accepted	The meeting agreed that there was no reason why proposals for appointing new members could not be voted on at general meetings during the year. It was agreed that there was nothing to prevent the committee asking additional members of the Society to attend Committee meetings and to support it in areas of particular expertise or where assistance was needed, but these would not become members of the Committee as a result.
H	Accepted	
J	Replaced by a separate paragraph as follows: The committee will consult the membership of the Society in matters relating to the appointment of the conductor.	The new text refers to any matter relating to the conductor's appointment – i.e. its continuation, the modification of terms or proposals to terminate it.
K	Withdrawn	
L	Withdrawn	It was agreed that the proposed amendment did nothing to change the sense of the current wording.
Deletions to paragraph 7(i)	The words 'by the Chair' to remain in the constitution. The words from 'but if the matter includes...' to the end of the paragraph to be deleted.	The former was seen as an unnecessary restriction to the chair's ability to call meetings of the committee. The latter is consequential on the acceptance of G, which abolishes co-opted members.
M	Withdrawn	This was seen as an unnecessary constraint to place on the Chair. It was noted that the final report should include text about the desirability of conducting committee meetings in a way which made it possible for as many members of the committee as possible to attend and participate. The Convenor noted that, in his experience, committee meetings were always

		carried out on this basis.
N	Withdrawn	This was an unnecessary constraint on the management of the business of the committee.
P	Withdraw 'half' but accept quorum of 4 or one third, whichever is larger.	The WG believed that a group of 3 was too small, but did not think that the increase to 4 should present an insuperable difficulty. Those in the WG who had served on the Committee could not recall an occasion when there were less than 4 present at a Committee meeting
Q	Withdrawn	The WG considered that the proposed amendment referred to actions which were not within the scope of the Committee. However, it was agreed that the purpose of the amendment could be served by an interpretation of 7(vi) of the present constitution and by making it explicit in 7(v) that the minutes of the committee were available for inspection by members of the orchestra.
R	withdrawn	It was agreed that the report should comment that there was a general expectation that when the Chair exercised a casting vote, it should be with reference to the Chair's understanding of the general wishes of the membership.
S	Withdrawn, but the following inserted in 7(v) after 'for inspection as required' of the words ' including by members of the Society'.	
Deletion of paragraph 7(vi)	withdrawn	
T	withdrawn	It was noted that the EGM procedure provided the remedy sought in this amendment.
U	withdrawn	This amendment was unnecessary – a general meeting cannot in any case conduct business.
V	withdrawn	This was considered to be unnecessary since the opportunity to discuss the Committee's work is in discussing the annual report, and the members have the opportunity to make their collective views known in the subsequent elections.
W	Accepted	
X	withdrawn	It was agreed that increasing the quorum of general meetings risked them being inquorate, which in turn increased the risk of the Society being unable to make decisions or appoint committee members and officers.
Y	Withdrawn	These amendments were withdrawn since the WG took the view that the changes would
Z	Withdrawn	
Aa	Withdrawn	
Ab	Withdrawn	
LB1	Not to be recommended in the report	

Committee members not to be trustees		governance structure for a charity, it was thought that this would be unduly complex for an organisation as small as ours. It was also thought that the separation of financial responsibility (which rests with the trustees) from the decision making of the committee would be undesirable.
LB2 Nominations at the AGM	Accepted	this is as W above
LB3 Confirmation of uncontested nominees	Not to be recommended in the report	It was thought that the remedy for members if they do not want someone to be on the committee is to ensure that there is a contested election. Having a vote when there is no contest would lead to an invidious vote of no confidence in an individual candidate.
LB4 Chair's role at AGM	Noted (but not for amendment to the constitution)	It was agreed that the circumstances of the 2010 AGM had been unusual and that the practice of the outgoing chair chairing the whole meeting should be the usual practice.
LB5 Timing of EGMs	Noted as already permissible. Report to refer to the need for AGMs and EGMs to be called so as to be as inclusive as possible of the membership.	